

## Before the Federal Communications Commission Washington, D.C. 20554

In the Matter of:	)	
	)	
Interconnection Between	)	
Local Exchange Carriers	)	CC Docket No. 95-185
and Commercial Mobile Radio	)	,—
Service Providers	)	- mouldi
	)	DOCKET FILE COPY ORIGINAL
Equal Access and Interconnection	)	DOOVE LLIÈME
Obligations Pertaining to	)	
Commercial Mobile Radio	)	CC Docket No. 94-54
Service Providers	•	

## REPLY COMMENTS OF ALLTEL CORPORATION

ALLTEL Corporation<sup>1</sup> ("ALLTEL") hereby submits its reply comments in the above-referenced matter.<sup>2</sup> For the same reasons set forth in its comments, ALLTEL continues to believe that the imposition by the Commission of a bill and keep regimen governing LEC/CMS interconnection, whether interim or not, would at this time be ill-advised. Not only would a bill and keep mandate deprive LECs of the recovery of legitimate costs associated with interconnection, it would, as well, precipitate an unfortunate jurisdictional controversy far too

No. of Copies rec'd\_(

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> As noted in its comments filed in this proceeding, ALLTEL Corporation is a publicly held holding corporation with diverse communications interests including both independent wireline and wireless subsidiaries.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The filing date for reply comments in CC Docket No. 95-185 was extended to March 25, 1996 by Order and Supplemental Notice of Proposed Rulemaking, FCC 96-61 (Released February 16, 1996.)

early in the life of the Telecommunications Act of 1996. ALLTEL, not unlike other parties<sup>3</sup> concludes that, in the new competitive environment, the best interim solution is to afford LECs both the flexibility to negotiate fair, cost-based interconnection agreements with CMS providers and the opportunity for good faith compliance with the obligations imposed under the 1996 Act.

I. The Basis of the Commission's Bill and Keep Proposal Remains Fundamentally Flawed-- The Negotiation Process Works.

The Commission noted in the NPRM that CMS carriers have had difficulty in negotiating satisfactory agreements under the Commission's current mutual compensation policy for LEC/CMS interconnection. While some parties shared the Commission's view, the experience of other parties<sup>4</sup> is instructive because it demonstrates that interconnection agreements may be satisfactorily negotiated for CMS systems located outside the region in which a carrier provides land line service, and in which they are without the substantial market power traditionally attributed to LECs by the CMS industry. Indeed, as noted by USTA, many of the parties advocating bill and keep, have both substantial financial resources and traffic levels sufficient to successfully negotiate interconnection. <sup>5</sup> These experiences and the absence of high profile complaints before the Commission respecting interconnection (despite the CMS industry's often stated belief that the Commission has plenary authority over CMS) strongly suggest that bill and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See generally the comments of Bell Atlantic Nynex Mobile, Inc.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See generally the comments of SBC Communications, Inc.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> See USTA comments at page 6.

keep is, at this time, a solution in search of a problem.<sup>6</sup>

II. In the Absence of Mandated CMS to CMS Interconnection, LEC Costs for Terminating CMS Traffic Should be Recovered.

ALLTEL concurs with USTA and other parties that below-cost termination under a bill and keep regimen provides a disincentive to carriers to construct alternative facilities and seek the most efficient forms of interconnection. The Commission's proposal would permit a particular class of carrier to avoid new investment in alternative facilities and simply take advantage of the capital costs incurred by other carriers. In earlier comments in CC Docket No. 94-54, including those of ALLTEL, many wireless carriers objected to any form of mandated CMS to CMS interconnection. ALLTEL argued that until justified by appropriate levels of CMS to CMS traffic, the wireline network should serve as the backbone network of wireless carriers. But under bill and keep, the costs associated with interconnection would not be recovered. The manifestly unfair result of bill and keep, therefore, is to position the LEC to serve as the carrier's backbone network without payment of a portion of the costs associated with rendering that service.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See generally the comments of USTA.

III. The Commission Should Not Precipitate a Jurisdictional Controversy This Early in the Life of the 1996 Act. Rather, the Commission Must Focus on the Task of Implementing the 1996 Act in the Appropriate Sequence.

The extent of the Commission's jurisdiction over CMS and related LEC interconnection agreements under both the 1993 Omnibus Budget Reconciliation Act and the Telecommunications Act of 1996 is, to state the obvious, hotly debated by the parties. Despite its admiration of both the skill and athleticism with which various advocates of bill and keep have presented their preemption arguments, ALLTEL concludes that CMS/LEC interconnection arrangements are subject to the provisions and process detailed in Sections 251 and 252 of the 1996 Act.

In support of its position, ALLTEL need not reiterate here the arguments so well made by others. <sup>7</sup> Rather, ALLTEL agrees with parties<sup>8</sup> who advocate a deferral of the instant proceeding in order to both permit agreements to be reformed in accordance with the interconnection obligations newly imposed on incumbent LECs by the 1996 Act and to permit the instant proceeding to be consolidated into a larger one considering across the board interconnection reform. Rather than unilaterally mandating bill and keep at this time, the Commission must focus on the broader reforms implicated by the 1996 Act, including interconnection charges, access charge structure, LEC rate rebalancing and universal service mechanisms. Interconnection agreements may be negotiated under the authority of the states in accordance with Section 252 of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> In this connection, see the comments of USTA, SBC Communications, Inc., GTE Service Corporation, and Cincinnati Bell.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> See comments of Frontier Corporation, Bell Atlantic Nynex Mobile, Inc., U.S. West and SBC Communications, Inc.

the Act during the pendency of these proceedings.

Unlike those parties urging the Commission to extend its jurisdictional reach and mandate bill and keep, ALLTEL believes that the Section 252 process provides CMS carriers with ample protection against real or alleged LEC abuse of market power. The Commission itself noted that many states have already implemented a bill and keep regimen. Further, and in the wake of the 1996 Act, deferral of the instant proceeding would not leave CMS providers unprotected and subject to the whims of the local LEC. To the contrary, under the Section 252 process, CMS carriers unsatisfied with a LEC's interconnection offer may have the matter submitted to the state for arbitration.

Ultimately, ALLTEL believes that LECs should have the opportunity to shoulder in good faith those obligations placed on them by the 1996 Act before a bill and keep mandate can be justified. Many LECs, both large and small, favor the move to cost-based interconnection rates devoid of implicit subsidies. The Commission must remain focused on the complexities of implementing the 1996 Act and the transition to a "minute paid for a minute used" environment-the benefit of which will flow to all interconnecting carriers including CMS providers. Rather than engaging in dubious attempts to foster local exchange competition on the backs of LECs through below-cost termination, the Commission should first provide LECs, and particularly

independent LECs, with the regulatory flexibility needed rebalance rates and recover costs from all network interconnectors in a fair and equitable manner.

Respectfully submitted,

**ALLTEL Corporation** 

Glenn S. Rabin

Federal Regulatory Counsel

ALLTEL Corporate Services, Inc.

ALLTEL Corporate Services, Inc. 655 15th Street, N.W. Suite 220 Washington, D.C. 20005 March 25, 1996

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Sondra Spottswood, a secretary in the Office of ALLTEL Corporate Services Inc.

hereby certify that I have this 25th day of March, 1996 placed a copy of the foregoing "Reply

Comments of ALLTEL Corporation" in the United States mail, postage prepaid, addressed to the

following:

David R. Poe
LeBOUEF, LAMB, GREENE & MacRAE, LLP
1875 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.
Washington, DC 20009-5728
Counsel for Time Warner
Communications Holdings, Inc.

James F. Rogers/Steven H. Schulman
LATHAM & WATKINS
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Suite 1300
Washington, DC 20004
Attorneys for Vanguard Cellular Systems, Inc.

Charles H. Helein, General Counsel America's Carrier's Telecommunications Association Helein & Associates 8180 Greensboro Drive Suite 700 McLean, Virginia 22102

Mark J. Golden, Vice President-- Industry Affairs Robert R. Cohen, Personal Communications Industry Association 500 Montgomery Street, Suite 700 Alexandria, Virginia 22314-1561

Judith St. Ledger-Roty, Jonathan E. Canis, Paul G. Madison - REED SMITH SHAW & McCLAY 1301 K Street, N.W.
Suite 1100 - East Tower
Washington, DC 20005
Counsel for Paging Network, Inc.

Jay L. Birnbaum
Jeff A. Brueggeman
Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom
1440 New York Avenue, N.W.
Washington, DC 20005
Attorneys for New Par

John T. Scott, III
NYNEX Mobile, Inc.
CROWELL & MORING
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, DC 20004-2595
Attorney for Bell Atlantic NYNEX Mobile, Inc.

Lewis J. Paper
David B. Jeppsen
DICKSTEIN, SHAPIRO, & MORIN, L.L.P.
2101 L Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20037-1526
Attorneys for Cellular Resellers Association, Inc.

Michael J. Ettner, Senior Assistant General Counsel GENERAL SERVICES ADMINISTRATION 18th & F Streets, N.W., Room 402 Washington, DC 20405

Richard P. Thayer
James A. Sanborn
Union Telephone Company
13 Central Street
PO Box 577
Farmington, NH 03835

David L. Hill
Audrey P. Rasmussen
O'Connor & Hannan, L.L.P.
1919 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., Suite 800
Washington, D.C. 20006-3483
Counsel to Florida Cellular RSA Limited Partnership

Scott K. Morris
Cathleen Massey
AT&T Wireless Services, Inc.
1150 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.
4th Floor
Washington, DC 20036

Richard Rubin
Stein N. Teplitz
Fleischman and Walsh, L.L.P.
1400 16th Street, Suite 600
Washington, D.C. 20036
Counsel for Centennial Cellular Corporation

Frederick M. Joyce & Amy Brett Joyce & Jacobs, Attys at Law, LLP 1019 19th Street, N.W. 14th Floor, PH-2 Washington, DC 20036 Counsel for Celpage Inc.

Michael R. Bennet & Caressa D. Bennett Bennet & Bennet 1831 Ontario Place, NW, Suite 200 Washington, DC 20009 Counsel for Cellular-Moblie Systems of St. Cloud General Partnership

Susan W. Smith Director, External Affairs Century Cellunet, Inc. 3050 Summerhill, #4 Texarkana, TX 75501

Cheryl A. Tritt
Morrison & Foerster, LLP
2000 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Suite 5500
Washington, DC 20006
Counsel to ICO Global Communications

David M. Wilson, Esq.
Young, Vogl, Harlick, Wilson, & Simpson, LLP
425 California Street, Suite 2500
San Francisco, California 94104
Counsel for the Allied Personnal Communications
Industry Association of California and Weslink Company

Steven Sivitz PCS Business Development 9645 Scranton Rd.. San Diego, CA 92121

Elizabeth R. Sachs, Esq.
David L Nace, Esq.
Lukas, McGowan, Nace & Gutierrez
1111 19th Street, N.W., Suite 1200
Washington, DC 20036
Counsel for American Mobile Telecom. Assoc., Inc.

Richard S. Myers
Myers Keller Communications Law Group
1030 15th Street, N.W.
Suite 908
Washington, DC 20005
Counsel for SE Telephone Limited Partnership, LTD.

David H. Pawlick & Jay Birnbaum
Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom
1440 New York Avenue, N. W.
Washington, DC 20005
Counsel for Cellular Communications of Puerto Rico,
Inc.

John Staurulakis, Inc. 6315 Seabrook Road Seabrook, MD 20706

Gene DeJordy, Esquire Western Wireless Corporation 330 120th Ave., N.E. - Suite 200 Bellevue, WA 98005 J. Manning Lee

Vice President, Regulatory Affairs
Teleport Communications Group, Inc.
Two Teleport Drive, Suite 300
Staten Island, N.Y. 10311

Richard D. Adams
President, Rural Cellular Association
2120 L Street, N.W.
Suite 520
Washington, DC 20037

Mark J. Tauber & Mark J. O'Connor Piper & Marbury, LLP 1200 19th Street, N.W. Seventh Floor Washington, DC 20036 Counsel to Omnipoint Corporation

Rural Cellular Corporation PO Box 1027 2819 Highway 29 South Alexandria, MN 56308

David A. Gross
Kathleen Q. Abernathy
AirTouch Communications, Inc.
1818 N Street, N.W.
Suite 800
Washington, DC 20036

Larry A. Blosser
Donald J. Elardo
MCI
1801 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20006

Jeffrey S. Linder Wiley, Rein & Fielding 1776 K Street, NW Washington, DC 20006 David L. Nace & Thomas Gutierrez
Lukas, McGowan, Nace & Gutierrez, Chtd.
Suite 1200
1111 Nineteenth Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20036
Counsel to CMT Partners and Alliance of Wireless S.P.

Laura H. Philips
Dow, Lohnes & Albertson
1200 New Hampshire Avenue, NW, Suite 800
Washington, DC 20036-6802
Counsel to Comcast Corporation and Cox Enterprises,
Inc.

Christine M. Crowe & Carl W. Northrop Bryan Cave LLP 700 Thirteenth Street, N.W. Suite 700 Washington, DC 20005-3960 Counsel to Arch Communications Group, Inc.

Leon M. Kestenbaum Jay C. Keithley H. Richard Juhnke Sprint Corporation 1850 M Street, N.W. Washington, DC 20036

Michael Mowery
Pamela Riley
AirTouch Communications, Inc.
One California Street
San Fransisco, CA 94105

Catherine R. Sloan, Richard Fructerman Richard S. Whitt WORLDCOM, INC. LDDS WorldCom 1120 Connecticut Avenue, NW - Suite 400 Washington, DC 20036

Mickey Sims General Manager and CEO Poka Lambro Telephone Cooperative, Inc. P O Box 1340 Tahoka, TX 79373-1340 James A Crary
Senior Attorney
Anchorage Telephone Utility
600 Telephone Avenue
Anchorage, AK 99503

Lisa Zaina
General Counsel
OPASTO
21 Dupont Circle, NW
Washington, DC 20036

## Genevieve Morelli

The Competitive Telecommunications Association 1140 Connecticut Avenue, N.W. Suite 220 Washington, DC 20036

Mary McDermott Linda Kent Charles D. Cosson USTA 1401 H Street, NW, Suite 600 Washington, DC 20005

Jeffrey S. Bork
Robert B. McKenna
US West, Inc.
1020 19th Street, N.W, Suite 700
Washington, DC 20036

Joe D. Edge
Mark F. Dever
Drinker Biddle & Reath
901 Fifteenth Street, N. W.
Washington, DC 20005
Counsel to the Puerto Rico Telephone Company

Frank Michael Panek Ameritech Room 4H84 2000 West Ameritech Center Drive Hoffman Estates, IL 60196-1025 Laura C. Mow, Charles C. Hunter
Terry F. Berman
Hunter & Mow, P.C.
1620 I Street, N.W., Suite 701
Washington, DC 20006
Counsel to Telecommunications Resellers Association

David Cosson
L. Marie Guillroy
Steven Watkins
NTCA
2626 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.
Washington, DC 20037

William D. Baskett III, Thomas Taylor, David S.Bence Frost & Jacobs 2500 PNC Center 201 East Fifth Street Cincinnati, Ohio 45201-5715 Counsel to the Cincinnati Bell Telephone Company

Jonathan M. Chambers Vice President of Public Affairs Sprint Spectrum. L.P. 1801 K Street, N.W., Suite M-112 Washington, DC 20036

Margaret E. Garber Pacific Bell 1275 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W. Washington, DC 20004

Kevin C. Gallagher 360 Communications Company 8725 Higgins Road Chicago, IL 60631

James G. Pachulski Bell Atlantic Telephone 1320 North Court House Road Eighth Floor Arlington, Virginia 22201 David G. Richards
Charles F. Featherstun
BellSouth
1133 21st Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20036

Barry R. Rubens Senior Vice President Concord Telephone 68 Cabarrus Avenue East Concord, NC 28026-0227

Gail L. Polivy Andre J. Lachance GTE 1850 M Street, N.W. Suite 1200 Washington, DC 20036

Paul Rogers, Charles D. Gray James Bradford Ramsay NARUC 1102 ICC Building PO Box 684 Washington, DC 20044

Steven T. Nourse, Assistant Attorney General Public Utilities Section 180 East Broad Street Columbus, OH 43215-3783

Reginald J. Smith, Chairperson Connecticut Department of Public Utility Control One Central Park Plaza New Britain, CT 06051

Durward D. Dupre, Darryl Howard Mary W. Marks SBC Communications, Inc. One Bell Center Room 3558 Saint Louis, MO 63101 Donald C. Rowe Saul Fisher NYNEX 1111 Westchester Avenue White Plains, NY 10604

Michael J. Shortley, III Frontier Corporation 180 South Clinton Avenue Rochester, New York 14646

Peter Arth, Jr.
505 Van Ness Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102
Counsel for the People of California and the Public
Utilities Commission of the State of California

Maureen O. Helmer, General Counsel NYSDPS Three Empire State Plaza Albany, NY 12223-1350

Richard A. Askoff NECA 100 South Jefferson Road Whippany, New Jersey 07981

James D. Ellis SBC Communications, Inc. 175 E. Houston Room 1254 San Antonio, Texas 78205

Bruce Beard SBC Communications, Inc. 17330 Preston Road Suite 100A Dallas, TX 75252 Anne Schelle Vice President, External Affairs American Personal Communications 6901 Rockledge Drive, Suite 600 Bethesda, MD 20817

John F. Tharp
The Illinois Telephone Association
P.O. Box 730
300 East Monroe Street
Springfield, Illinois 62705

Jeanne M. Walsh Kurtis & Associates, P.C. 2000 M Street, N.W., Suite 600 Washington, DC 20036 Counsel for North Carolina 4 Cellular Limited Partnership John Hearne, Chairman 100 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 1000 Santa Monica, California 90401 Point Communications Company

Richard L. Oberdorfer c/o Halley, Bader & Potts Suite 900 4350 North Fairfax Drive Arlington, VA 22203-1633 Counsel for Western Radio Services Co., Inc.

Sondra Spottswood